Interactive comment on “System Identification, Fuzzy Control, and Simulation Results for Fixed Length Tether of Kite Power System” by Tarek N. Dief et al

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 13 December 2017

The topic is definitively unique and the work you have done is remarkable. Nevertheless, the paper does need some work to be considered for a final publication. I would therefore, urge you to consider the following point for an improvement:

1. There are some language issues I have. Sometimes sentences are hard to read, not easy to understand or repeat certain words (like “and”) very often. Also always keep articles in mind: It is “The” kite system on line 14 on page 1. Please also check line 8-9 on page 2. Line 10 (ending) on page 2. The “ands” in line 19-20 and the sentences around it on page 2. “The thing that” on line 8 on page 3. “The” average system model on line 13 same page. “Another thing” in line 20 page 3 – which thing? . . . so please reread the text critically concerning the language and expression!

2. Page 2: Where does the wind energy density range from . . . ? Is this globally?? Please cite a source!

3. Page 3 Paragraph lines 14-19, please rephrase a bit and watch the language. It should be formal.

4. Page 3 in the paragraph afterwards: How can a technique be promising, if it is only valid for a non realistic case?

5. Page 3 and further: What is a classical controller? Is this defined somewhere?

6. Define all magnitudes used in the equations in the text! All! Otherwise the rest gets seriously unclear.

7. Page 5 line 11 you mention, that you minimize Jk. How? Where is this mathematically described?

8. In the section 3, please make sure, you cite every source you have been using properly.

9. Equation (17), why did you use these magnitudes? How did you get them?

10. Section 3.3, please refer to some source for further reading. Remember: It is science. This means everything you have been done, needs to be possibly redone by others to check for validity. This should be possible after reading your paper and all the sources you cited.

11. In figures 4, 5, 6, 7, 11, 12: What are the magnitudes on the y-axis? Where is this explained?

12. On page 11 line 2 you mention classical (?) and fuzzy control in the figures. But it doesn’t say in the caption of the figures, which is which.

14. Why is in figures 8,9, 14, 15 the path given in degrees? Please give a reason in the text.

15. On page 14 line 5 you mention for the first time “hardware in the loop”. What do you mean by this now – as you mention it the first time.