

# Vortex Particle-Mesh simulations of Vertical Axis Wind Turbine flows: from the blade aerodynamics to the very far wake

## Reply to editors

P Chatelain<sup>a</sup>, M Duponcheel<sup>a</sup>, D-G Caprace<sup>a</sup>, Yves Marichal<sup>b</sup>, G Winckelmans<sup>a</sup>

<sup>a</sup>*Institute of Mechanics, Materials and Civil Engineering, Université catholique de Louvain, 1348 Louvain-la-Neuve, Belgium*

<sup>b</sup>*Wake Prediction Technologies (WaPT), Rue Louis de Geer 6, 1348 Louvain-la-Neuve, Belgium*

---

---

We have addressed all the changes by the editors and reviewers. They are listed below.

---

**Comment 1.** I suggest you make the discussion of the definition of  $S_1$ , and the outflow on the sides of the domain, clearer.

---

We have expanded the discussion around the definition of  $S_1$ : *These diagnostics correspond to integrals of flux quantities in cross-stream sections located at a distance  $x$  downstream of the turbine axis; their practical implementation approximates these integrals through quadrature over finite square sections  $[-3D, 3D] \times [-3D, 3D]$ . Because our Biot-Savart solver enforces transverse unbounded conditions exactly, it allows a transverse mass flow due to blockage. As a consequence,  $S_1$ , shown in Fig. ??, does not vanish (as it would have for a solver with no-through flow boundaries); it quantifies the blockage effect caused by the wake on the flow.*

---

**Comment 2.** Already in the abstract, please indicate the nature of the "unexpected topological flow features". It is neither perfectly clear from the conclusion what is "unexpected".

---

We agree with the editor that this was not clear. We have removed the adjective "unexpected", made the features more explicit, and thus changed the abstract.

---

**Comment 3.** Related to the previous point, does Figure 6 show the resolved TKE, or total TKE (resolved+modeled)?

---

Figure 6 shows resolved TKE only; this is now mentioned in the caption.

---

**Comment 4.** In addition to the comment by the associate editor, would it be possible to add to section 6 that if anyone is interested in (parts of) the data then please contact the authors?

---

Changed accordingly.